## Cummins ISB *Mostly Official* Matrix Analysis

### October 26, 2005

# **Analysis Summary**

- 17 Valid Tests Analyzed
  - 15 Matrix Tests, 2 Reference Tests
  - Tappet Wear, Camshaft Wear, Crosshead Wear
- E178 (95% CI) Used on Wear Results
  - Wear Profile Offset Not Necessary
  - All Results and Analysis Outlier Screened
- Wear Relationship with Soot Possible
  - Tappet Wear and Crosshead Wear
  - Correlations with Stand and Stage B Average Torque

# **Analysis Summary**

- Possible Lab/Stand Effects
- No Transformations
  - Higher Wear Oils Would Likely Require
- Oil Discrimination
  - Tappet Weight Loss
  - Possible for Camshaft Wear (Model Dependent)
- All 3 Wear Parameters Meet ACC Precision
  - Note that Tappet Wear Between Stands and Labs Does Not

### Concerns

- Model Dependent Conclusions
  - Some Confounding (Stand, Stage B Average Torque, and Soot)
- Correcting Camshaft Wear for Stage B Average
  Torque
  - Correcting Test Results for an Operational Parameter is not an Ideal Situation.
- Reference Frequency Given Engine, Stand and Lab Differences
  - Very Large Stand Effects for Tappet Wear

Attachment 9; Page 5 of 30

### **Precision Summary**

	Repeatability s	Reproducibility s	Reproducibility s
Tappet Wear	8.1645	16.8574	16.9092
(mg) Soot Adj	Ep=1.84	Ep=0.89	Ep=0.89
Camshaft Wear (um)	4.7021	7.1512	7.1512
	Ep=3.19	Ep=2.10	Ep=2.10
XHead Wear (mg) Soot Adj	0.3817	0.3817	0.5221
	Ep=1.96	Ep=1.96	Ep=1.44
Torque Adjstd Cam Wear (um)	5.0833	5.0833	6.3063
	Ep=2.95	Ep=2.95	Ep=2.38

### **Target Summary**

	Oil 830-2	PC10B	PC10E
Tappet Wear	LS Mean = 88.23	LS Mean = 93.47	LS Mean = 67.54
(mg) Soot Adj	Mean = 85.8167	Mean = 88.6833	Mean = 57.86
	S = 16.1416	S = 15.8176	S = 9.4796
Camshaft Wear	LS Mean = 40.20	LS Mean = 44.85	LS Mean = 36.86
(um)	Mean =40.2667	Mean = 41.9833	Mean = 34.14
	S = 9.2058	S = 5.6722	S = 5.0093
XHead Wear	LS Mean = 2.072	LS Mean = 2.057	LS Mean = 1.940
(ma) Soot Adi	Mean = 2.0833	Mean = 2.0667	Mean = 2.0000
	S = 0.5345	S = 0.4367	S = 0.4743
Torque Adjstd Cam Wear (um)	LS Mean = 40.86	LS Mean = 42.29	LS Mean = 33.94
	Mean =40.86	Mean = 42.2984	Mean = 33.0695
()	S = 6.8895	S = 4.7694	S = 6.0193

Attachment 9; Page 7 of 30

### **Correlation Summary**

Between Oil and Within Oil Correlations

Between Oil	OSACSW	OSATWL	OSACWL
OSACSW	1.00	0.79	0.56
OSATWL	0.79	1.00	0.54
OSACWL	0.56	0.54	1.00

Within Oil	OSACSW	OSATWL	OSACWL
OSACSW	1.00	0.54	0.33
OSATWL	0.54	1.00	0.20
OSACWL	0.33	0.20	1.00

# Average Tappet Weight Loss

- ATWL = f(Lab, Stand(Lab), Oil, Avg Soot)
  - Oil Discrimination (Overall p-value=0.005)
    - PC10E Lower than Other Oils
  - Lab Differences (Overall p-value=0.02)
    - Lab B Higher than Lab G
    - Stand within Lab Effects (Overall p-value=0.02)
  - Correction for Average Soot
    - Slope=76 (Correct Back to 3.50% Soot)
    - SA ATWL = ATWL  $76^*$ (AvgSoot 3.50)

# Tukey Adjusted p-Values

	Oil 830-2	PC10B	PC10E
Tappet Wear (mg) Soot Adj	LS Mean = 88.23 StdErr = 3.766	LS Mean = 93.47 StdErr = 3.710	LS Mean = 67.54 StdErr = 4.794
Oil 830-2		0.61	0.01
PC10B	0.61		0.005
PC10E	0.01	0.005	



### OS Tappet Weight Loss as a Function of Oil and Soot



#### OS Tappet Weight Loss as a Function of Stage B Average Torque







### OS Tappet Weight Loss as a Function of Stand and Oil



### OS Soot Adjusted Tappet Weight Loss as a Function of Stand and Oil

### Average Camshaft Wear

- ACSW = f(Lab, Stand(Lab), Oil)
  - Some Evidence of Oil Discrimination (p=0.08)
    - PC10B versus PC10E (p=0.07)
  - Lab Differences (Overall p-value=0.05)
    - Lab G Lower than Other Labs
    - Stand within Lab Effects (Overall p-value=0.02)
  - Other Possible Effects
    - Stage B Average Torque

# Tukey Adjusted p-Values

	Oil 830-2	PC10B	PC10E
Camshaft Wear (um)	LS Mean = 40.2 StdErr = 2.137	LS Mean = 44.85 StdErr = 2.137	LS Mean = 36.86 StdErr = 2.473
Oil 830-2		0.33	0.54
PC10B	0.33		0.07
PC10E	0.54	0.07	



OS ACSW (um)





#### OS Average Camshaft Wear as a Function of Stage B Average Torque



### OS Average Camshaft Wear as a Function of Oil and Lab



#### OS Average Camshaft Wear as a Function of Stand and Oil

20

### Average Camshaft Wear

- ACSW = f(Lab, Oil, Stage B Avg Torque)
  - Some Evidence of Oil Discrimination (p=0.06)
    - PC10B versus PC10E (p=0.06)
  - Some Evidence of Lab Differences (p=0.06)
    - Lab B Higher than Other Labs
  - Torque Correction
    - Slope=0.26629 (Correct Back to 800)
    - SA ACSW = ACSW 0.26629\*(Torque 800)

# Tukey Adjusted p-Values

	Oil 830-2	PC10B	PC10E
Camshaft Wear (um)	LS Mean = 40.86 StdErr = 2.082	LS Mean = 42.29 StdErr = 2.077	LS Mean = 33.94 StdErr = 2.409
Oil 830-2		0.88	0.12
PC10B	0.88		0.06
PC10E	0.12	0.06	



### OS Torque Adjusted Average Camshaft Wear as a Function of Oil and Lab



### OS Torque Adjusted Average Camshaft Wear as a Function of Stand and Oil

## Average Crosshead Mass Loss

- ACWL = f(Lab, Oil, Avg Soot)
  - No Oil Discrimination (Overall p-value=0.85)
  - Lab Differences (Overall p-value=0.02)
    - Lab A Lower than Other Labs
    - No Stand within Lab Effects
  - Correction for Average Soot
    - Slope=1.3 (Correct Back to 3.50% Soot)
    - SA ACWL = ACWL 1.3\*(AvgSoot 3.50)

# Tukey Adjusted p-Values

	Oil 830-2	PC10B	PC10E
XHead Wear (mg) Soot Adj	LS Mean = 2.072 StdErr = 0.1559	LS Mean = 2.057 StdErr = 0.1564	LS Mean = 1.944 StdErr = 0.1803
Oil 830-2		0.99	0.85
PC10B	0.99		0.89
PC10E	0.85	0.89	



#### OS Average Crosshead Mass Loss as a Function of Oil and Soot



#### OS Average Crosshead Mass Loss as a Function of Stage B Average Torque



### OS Average Crosshead Mass Loss as a Function of Oil and Lab





