## EXIT CRITERIA BALLOT

## ASTM-HDEOCP <br> BALLOT FOR VOTING MEMBERS ONLY <br> Reference: Jim Mc Geehan, Chairman

Issue Date: March $2^{\text {th }}, 2005$
Receipt Deadline:
March $24^{\text {th }}, 2005$

## RETURN BALLOT TO:

Pat Connelly via email (preferred): patconnelly@chevrontexaco.com or via Fax: 510-242-3758

Name: William Kleiser
Organization: Chevron Oronite LLC
Date: March 21, 2005
Phone No.: 5102423027

| Motion | Affirmative | Negative |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| The following motion was made at the HDEOCP and <br> passed unanimously. <br> MOTION |  |  |
| Acceptance of the proposed Mack T-10 limits to <br> qualify an oil as passing the Mack T-9 test. <br> (Reference limits below) <br> Microsoft PowerPoint <br> Presentation | $\square$ | $\searrow$ |

Comments:

Chevron Oronite supports the approach of using a variety lubricants run in both the Mack T9 and T10 tests to establish equivalent pass limits. However, we feel that the limits proposed for API CH-4 based on the T 10 require some revision for the following two reasons:

1) According to the data presented there appears to be a linear relationship between T 9 and T 10 lead described by the following equation: $\mathrm{T} 9 \mathrm{~Pb}=0.5089(\mathrm{~T} 10 \mathrm{~Pb})-5.486$. Using this equation we can calculate that based on the $\mathrm{CH}-4 \mathrm{~Pb}$ increase limit of 25 ppm , the equivalent T 10 limit is 60 ppm . The current proposed one run limit of 40 ppm corresponds to a T9 limit of 15 ppm , which is significantly different from the CH-4 pass limit and would represent a change in the performance standard.
2) Based on the average difference in Top Ring Weight Loss (TRWL), there is a 30 mg off set in severity. The T-9 CH-4 one run limit is 120 mg , this would translate to 150 mg in the T10, based on this data.

Based on the above issues, Chevron Oronite would be willing to accept limits similar to those listed below which we feel represent a direct conversion from the T9 to T10 based on the data presented.

T10 Top Ring Weight Loss, mg: 150
T10 Liner Wear Step, um: 30
T10 EOT Lead Increase, ppm: 60

