



Committee D-2 ON PETROLEUM PRODUCTS AND LUBRICANTS

*Chairman:* N. DAVID SMITH, North Carolina Dept. of Agric., 2 West Edenton St., P.O. Box 27647, Raleigh, NC 27611 (919-733-3313)  
FAX: 919-715-0524

*First Vice-Chairman:* SUSAN E. LITKA, UOP Research Center, 50 East Algonquin Rd., P.O. Box 5016, Des Plaines, IL 60017-5016  
(708-391-3390)

*Second Vice-Chairman:* KURT H. STRAUSS, 69 Brookside Rd., Portland, ME 04103 (207-773-4380) FAX: 207-775-6214

*Secretary:* KENNETH O. HENDERSON, Castrol North America, Automotive Div., 240 Centennial Ave., Piscataway, NJ 08854  
(908-980-3630) FAX: 908-980-9519

*Assistant Secretary:* W. JAMES BOVER, Exxon Biomedical Sciences, Inc., Mettlers Rd., CN2350, East Millstone, NJ 08875-2350 (908-873-6318)  
FAX: 908-873-6009

*Staff Manager:* EARL R. SULLIVAN (215-299-5514)

Reply to: Michael S. Griggs  
The Lubrizol Corporation  
29400 Lakeland Boulevard  
Wickliffe, OH 44092-2298

March 24, 2003

To: Members of the Single Cylinder Oil Test Engine (SCOTE) Surveillance  
Panel and guest participating in the March 21, 2003 teleconference.

Enclosed are the minutes of the SCOTE Surveillance panel teleconference. Please  
forward any corrections or additions to my attention.

Michael S. Griggs  
Secretary, SCOTE Surveillance Panel

## **TELECONFERENCE MINUTES**

### **SINGLE CYLINDER DIESEL SURVEILLANCE PANEL**

HELD MARCH 21, 2003  
VIA TELECONFERENCE  
At 13:00 CST

THIS DOCUMENT IS NOT AN ASTM STANDARD; IT IS UNDER CONSIDERATION WITHIN AN ASTM TECHNICAL COMMITTEE BUT HAS NOT RECEIVED ALL APPROVALS REQUIRED TO BECOME AN ASTM STANDARD. IT SHALL NOT BE REPRODUCED OR CIRCULATED OR QUOTED, IN WHOLE OR IN PART, OUTSIDE OF ASTM COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES EXCEPT WITH THE APPROVAL OF THE CHAIRMAN OF THE COMMITTEE HAVING JURISDICTION AND THE PRESIDENT OF THE SOCIETY. *COPYRIGHT ASTM, 100 BARR HARBOR DRIVE, WEST CONSHOHOCKEN, PA 19428-2959. ALL RIGHTS RESERVED*

#### **1.0 CALL TO ORDER**

- 1.1 This teleconference was scheduled by Scott Parke on March 20, 2003 at the request of Chairman Jim McCord.
- 1.2 Chairman Jim McCord began the teleconference with a roll call of voting members. The list of participants is attachment 1.

#### **2.0 1K/1N NEW LINERS**

- 2.1 The SCOTE Surveillance conducted a teleconference on 3-21-03, 1:00 CST to discuss adoption of new Cat 1K/1N liners.
- 2.2 Caterpillar expects new 1K/1N liners to arrive in the May-June timeframe. The first shipment will be 330 liners. With an approximate 10% rejection rate, this would leave 300 useable liners.
- 2.3 Jim McCord commented that labs should have an adequate supply of existing liners to last them throughout the remainder of the year and that might be a good time to run the new liner qualification testing. Abdul Cassim felt that it would be prudent to qualify them sooner in order to address potential problems and to make available a supply of qualified liners to test labs in England. Jim McCord agreed to talk with the non qualified labs to discuss the idea of them using production liners in lieu of the rushing the new liner qualifications. Abdul Cassim commented that Caterpillar would need some

time after liner receipt to conduct quality checks and that lab testing should not be before the July timeframe.

- 2.4 Jim McCord asked Scott Parke how many runs would be needed to qualify the new liners. Scott replied that the number was dependent on the number of labs, stands and reference oils. He estimated that a statistically sound analysis would require between 15 and 20 tests. Panel members generally agreed that this was not realistic. Abdul suggested that staying with a single reference oil would help to reduce the amount of testing required.
- 2.5 Jim McCord commented that if new liner qualification testing was started, he would still like to be able to use up the supply of existing liners. There was a lot of discussion regarding referencing of one liner type and running candidates on another. Dan Domonkos suggested that if the reference tests on the new liners were acceptable then labs could run on new liners. If a lab did not fall within the acceptance bands, they would not be calibrated. Dan acknowledged that risks were involved but the other alternatives were cost prohibitive. Dan then made the following motion at Mike Griggs' request:

**When new liners become available, labs are to run them in reference runs at their next reference period. If the results are acceptable, labs can continue to run tests with the old liners.** Abdul Cassim seconded the motion which passed 7 yes- 1 no.

### 3.0 POST TELECONFERENCE ACTION PLAN

- 3.1 On March 24, 2003, Scott Parke communicated the following to the SCOTE Surveillance panel via e-mail:

“During Friday's teleconference, the Surveillance Panel approved a motion stipulating that the test labs were to run their next 1K or 1N calibration test on the new cylinder liners. The labs would continue to run candidate tests on the 1Y3555 liners.

A calibration test is a test whether or not a stand using known oils under known conditions using known parts that will produce the expected result. A candidate test is a test conducted to see how results change when one of those variables is changed (namely, the oil). These are the two central tenets of standardized testing often paraphrased as 1) You don't experiment on reference tests and 2) You run candidate tests the same as you ran the reference.

For those reasons, TMC had no choice but to vote against the motion. In the case of information letters that can be expected to generate controversy, the information letter must be pre-balloted. The TMC would plan to vote negative then as well. In order to avoid the complications such a situation would create,

we would like to suggest that the chairman solicit industry statisticians for a recommended method of introduction for these new liners.”

- 3.2 Scott Parke has discussed the above with Chairman Jim McCord whose has agreed to the proposed action.

Attachment 1

March 24, 2003

**SCOTE Teleconference Participants**

Abdul Cassim- Caterpillar  
Roger Riviere- Caterpillar  
Scott Parke- TMC  
Ron Buck- TEI  
Bob Campbell- Ethyl  
Dan Domonkos- Lubrizol  
Mike Griggs- Lubrizol  
Jim Gutzwiller- Infineum  
Chris Mazuca- PerkinElmer  
Jim McCord- SWRI  
Mark Sutherland- Oronite